

NORTH HERTFORDSHIRE DISTRICT COUNCIL

PLANNING CONTROL COMMITTEE

**MEETING HELD IN THE COUNCIL CHAMBER, COUNCIL OFFICES. GERON ROAD,
LETCWOTH GARDEN CITY ON THURSDAY, 13TH DECEMBER, 2018 AT 7.30 PM**

MINUTES

Present: *Councillors (Chairman), Councillor Michael Muir (Vice-Chairman), Val Bryant (In place of Ian Mantle), Daniel Allen, Ruth Brown, Paul Clark, Sarah Dingley, Tony Hunter, Sue Ngwala, Harry Spencer-Smith and Michael Weeks*

In Attendance: *Tom Allington (Strategic Sites Planning Officer), Tom Donovan (Development Officer), Nurainatta Katevu (Planning Lawyer) and Amelia McInally (Committee and Member Services Officer)*

Also Present: *At the commencement of the meeting approximately 28 members of the public, including registered speakers.*

68 APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE

Audio Recording – Start time of Item – 33 seconds:

Apologies for absence were received from Councillors

Councillor Mike Rice
Councillor Bill Davidson
Councillor Ian Mantle
Councillor Mike Hughson
Councillor Cathryn Henry

Having given prior notice, Councillor Val Bryant advised that she would be substituting for Councillor Ian Mantle.

69 MINUTES - 15 NOVEMBER 2018

Audio Recording – Start time of Item – 51 seconds

RESOLVED: That the Minutes of the Meeting of the Committee held on 15th November 2018 be approved as a true record of the proceedings and be signed by the Chairman.

70 NOTIFICATION OF OTHER BUSINESS

Audio Recording – Start time of Item – 1 minute and 9 minutes

There was no other business notified.

71 CHAIRMAN'S ANNOUNCEMENTS

Audio Recording – Start time of Item – 1 minute 14 seconds

- (1) The Chairman announced that if the fire alarm were to sound, it would not be a test so all Members were advised that they would need to leave as quickly as possible by the nearest exit and if there was anyone with mobility issues, they were to alert a member of staff.
- (2) The Chairman announced that Members of the public and the press may use their devices to film/photograph, or do a sound recording of the meeting, but he asked them to not use flash and to disable any beeps or other sound notifications that emitted from their devices. In addition, the Chairman had arranged for the sound at this particular meeting to be recorded;
- (3) The Chairman announced that Members of the Public had five minutes for each group. This would also apply to Members Advocates. The bell would sound after 4½ minutes as a warning and then again at 5 minutes to signify that the presentation must cease;
- (4) The Chairman reminded Members that, in line with the Code of Conduct, any Declarations of Interest needed to be declared immediately prior to the item in question. Members who declared a Disclosable Pecuniary Interest must withdraw from the meeting for the duration of the item. Members who wished to declare a declarable interest must exercise a 'Councillor's Speaking Right' and must declare this at the time as an interest, move to the public area before speaking to the item and then must leave the room before the debate and vote;
- (5) The Chairman asked that, for the benefit of any Members of the Public present at the meeting, Officers announce their name and their designation to the meeting when invited to speak.

72 PUBLIC PARTICIPATION

Audio Recording – Start time of Item – 4 minutes 10 seconds

The Chairman confirmed that there were 10 registered speakers of which 3 Member Advocates were present.

73 18/01726/FP LAND WITHIN, RUSH GREEN MOTORS, LONDON ROAD, LANGLEY, HERTFORDSHIRE

Audio Recording – Start time of Item – 4 minutes and 7 seconds

Erection and use of a concrete batching plant together with associated infrastructure and access.

RESOLVED: *That the planning application for erection and use of a concrete batching plant 18/01726/FP be DEFERRED.*

REASON: *Awaiting written confirmation from the Secretary of State that he wished to call in the application.*

74 18/02515/S73 FORMER HAMILTON BILLIARDS AND GAMES CO, PARK LANE, KNEBWORTH, HERTS, SG3 6PJ

Residential development of 10 units comprising 9 x two bed flats, conversion and part two storey/part single storey side extension to existing building at the rear of the site to provide 4 parking spaces and cycle store at ground floor with 1 x 2 bed flat over and 18 car parking spaces within site following demolition of existing buildings. Repairing and raising of existing wall on northern boundary tot 2.5 metres in height and repairing and raising of existing wall to western boundary to 2.1 metres in height. Section 73 Application: Variation of Condition 11: Changes to the external and internal appearance of the scheme pursuant to Planning Permission 17/00883/1 (granted 09/08/2017) and as amended by 18/01468/NMA (granted 28/06/2018).

The Senior Planning Officer provided updates to the report in respect of planning application 18/02515/S73, supported by a visual presentation consisting of photographs, plans and explained that the application had been called in even though it was in support of the objection from the Parish Council.

The following people made a presentation in objection to the application:

- Mr Roger Willcocks
- Councillor Deakin-Davies (Member Advocate)

The following members asked questions of clarification of Mr Willcock's presentation:

- Councillor Harry Spencer-Smith

The following people made a presentation in support of the application:

- Miss Liz Fitzgerald

The following members asked clarification of Miss Fitzgerald's presentation:

- Councillor Harry Spencer-Smith
- Councillor Michael Weeks

The following Members asked questions or sought clarification from the Development Officer regarding the presentation of the report:

- Councillor Harry Spencer-Smith
- Councillor Michael Weeks
- Councillor Paul Clark
- Councillor Ruth Brown

The Committee debated the application. The following members contributed to the debate:

- Councillor Paul Clark
- Councillor Ruth Brown
- Councillor Michael Weeks
- Councillor Harry Spencer-Smith
- Councillor Val Bryant
- Councillor Tony Hunter

It was proposed, seconded and upon the vote:

Thursday, 13th December, 2018

RESOLVED: That Planning application 18/02515/S73 be **AGREED**, subject to the conditions and reasons set out in the report of the Development and Conservation Manager.

75 18/02194/OP HEATH FARM, POTTERSHEATH ROAD, POTTERSHEATH, HERTFORDSHIRE, AL6 9ST

Audio Recording – Start time of Item – 48 minutes and 17 seconds

Outline planning application (all matters reserved except access, layout and scale) for one 4-bed detached dwelling following demolition of existing buildings (Class B2, B8), stable blocks and portakabins (as amplified by drawings 17030-SP received 20/11/2018 and PL01D and 01C received 23/11/2018).

The Senior Planning Officer provided updates to the report in respect of planning application 18/02194OP supported by a visual presentation consisting of plans, drawings and photographs of the site.

The following Members asked questions or sought clarification regarding the presentation of the report:

- Councillor Paul Clark
- Councillor Michael Weeks
- Councillor Sue Ngwala
- Councillor Sarah Dingley

The Committee debated the application. The following members contributed to the debate:

- Councillor Harry Spencer-Smith
- Councillor Paul Clark
- Councillor Michael Muir

It was proposed, seconded and upon the vote:

RESOLVED: That Planning application 18/02194/OP be **AGREED**, subject to the conditions and reasons set out in the report of the Development and Conservation Manager.

76 18/02299/FP THE GABLES, HIGH STREET, BARLEY, ROYSTON, HERTFORDSHIRE, SG8 8HY

Audio Recording – Start time of Item – 1 hour 1 minute and 41 seconds

Erection of 10 no residential dwellings and provision of car parking area with all associated landscaping and ancillary works (as a revision to application 17/02316/1 approved on 30/05/18) (as amended by drawings received 8th November 2018).

The Principal Planning Officer provided updates to the report in respect of planning application 18/02299/FP supported by a visual presentation consisting of plans, drawings and photographs of the site.

The following people made a presentation in objection to the application:

Thursday, 13th December, 2018

- Mr Jeremy Carlisle (Chair of Barley Parish Council)
- Councillor Gerald Morris (Member Advocate made a presentation in objection to the application)

The following members asked questions of clarification of Mr Carlisle's presentation:

- Councillor Sue Ngwala

The following people made a presentation in support of the application:

- Mr Bill Bampton

The following members asked clarification of Mr Bampton's presentation:

- Councillor Ruth Brown
- Councillor Harry Spencer-Smith
- Councillor Michael Weeks

The Committee debated the application. The following members contributed to the debate:

- Councillor Tony Hunter
- Councillor Michael Weeks
- Councillor Paul Clark

It was proposed, seconded and upon the vote:

RESOLVED: That, application **18/02299/FP** be **REFUSED** planning permission, as per the Senior Conservation Officer's recommendations.

REASON: *The principle of residential development on this site would harm the character and appearance of the Barley Conservation Area as it would result in the loss of the existing open land which represents a transitional area from the village fringe to the rural countryside and which commands an important role in providing the rural setting of the Barley Conservation Area. The proposal would therefore harm the special character of the Barley Conservation Area and to a lesser extent, the setting of 'White Posts' a grade II listed building. The in-principle harm would be further exacerbated by the poor standard of design included as part of this proposal, which would be at odds with the semi-rural, edge-of-village context and which would fail to provide a cohesive appearance and form of development. Although the degree of harm is considered to be less than substantial, the public benefits of the proposal do not outweigh the harm that has been identified and which has been afforded significant weight. As a consequence the proposed development is contrary to Policies 6 and 57 of the North Hertfordshire District Local Plan No. 2 - with Alterations, Policies SP5, SP9, SP13, D1, CGB1 and HE1 of the Emerging North Hertfordshire Local Plan 2011-2031 as Modified and Sections 12 and 16 of the National Planning Policy Framework 2018.*

At the request of one of the Members, The Chairman announced that there would be a comfort break of five minutes.

Audio Recording – Start time of Item – Session 2 – 10 seconds

Alterations to roof and construction of first floor rear extension, single storey side and rear extensions following demolition of existing garage and insertion of front dormer window and gabled roof extension (as amended by plan No's DD2235-2 sheets 1, 2 & 3 G).

Councillor Harry Spencer-Smith had called this application in to the Committee on the grounds of public interest.

The Principal Planning Officer advised Members that this was a Council application for relatively extensive extensions to what was a chalet bungalow and Planning Permission had not been granted. The presentation was supported by a visual presentation consisting of photographs, proposed roof, floor and elevation plans.

The following members asked questions of clarification of the Principal Planning Officer's presentation:

- Councillor Michael Weeks
- Councillor Michael Muir
- Councillor Paul Clark
- Councillor Harry Spencer-Smith

The Committee debated the application. The following members contributed to the debate:

- Councillor Michael Weeks
- Councillor Jean Green

RESOLVED: *That Planning application 18/028083/FPH be **AGREED**, subject to the conditions and reasons set out in the report of the Development and Conservation Manager.*

78 PLANNING APPEALS

Audio Recording – Start time of Item – 9 minutes and 24 seconds

The Principal Planning Officer presented the report entitled Planning Appeals and drew attention to the following:

68 Danescroft Letchworth:

This appeal had been dismissed by the Inspector who agreed with the Officer's refusal to dismiss the appeal. The reason was due to the unacceptable appearance and established buildings around the area.

Land North of Mill Croft, Royston Road, Barkway:

This appeal had been dismissed by the Inspector as the local plan had been adequately progressed. It was dismissed on the basis that the appeal site forms an important part of the character and appearance and the setting of Barkway.

The Cabinet in Reed:

This appeal was dismissed by the Inspector on two grounds:

Thursday, 13th December, 2018

1. The Inspector suggested the ground could be viable therefore was not automatically considered
2. It would cause harm to part of the conservation area and the listed building itself.

The Station in Ashwell:

An appeal decision for the station in Ashwell was subject to a judicial review based on the Secretary of State's decision to discuss the appeal. An update was awaited.

In a final note, The Chairman announced that it was important that for those who were unable to attend, they must find a sub if possible. For all those Councillors who had not attended, only one sub was present at the meeting.

The meeting closed at 9.43 pm